

What is the Difference between *Sukhāvātī* and *Jingtu* 淨土? ¹⁾

Yue XIAO

Introduction

The present study is devoted to the origin of the Chinese term *jingtū* 淨土²⁾, which refers to the intention of rebirth in *Āmítúo*³⁾'s realm, on the basis of a comparative study between *sukhāvātī* and *jingtu*. According to the previous studies, the term *jingtu* is first used frequently in the early Mahāyāna sūtras, such as Kumārajīva's (344–413, or 350–409) translations⁴⁾; there, however, it does not refer to *Amituo*'s land, but rather means either purifying the Buddha land as a verb⁵⁾, or all of the Buddha's land in general. Moreover, *jingtu* was not used in the *Fōshūo āmítúo jīng* 佛說阿彌陀經 (hereafter *Amituo jing*, T12, No. 366), a unique sūtra concerning *Amituo*'s religion by Kumārajīva. This shows that

- 1) It is my pleasure to acknowledge four people here, for without them this paper would not have been finished at all. First and foremost is my supervisor, Prof. Ryuzen FUKUHARA 福原隆善, with whom I have enjoyed patience of discussions of every conceivable aspect of my study. Secondly, my director in the project of Compilation of the Catalogue of Literature on the Pure Land Buddhism (CCLP) at The Research Institute of Bukkyo University, Toshihide ADACHI 安達俊英, invited me to attend CCLP project and put this paper to publish. Thirdly, a distinguished scholar in the early Chinese Buddhist translations studies Seishi KARASHIMA gave me countless advanced methodology and knowledge in his study class of Early Chinese Translations sessions at Soka University. Finally, Robert L. LATTA took much time to polish my English. Any errors that remain are my own responsibility.
- 2) This is a further study of the paper, namely *What is the meaning of jingtu?*, presented at the 15th International Association of Buddhist Studies, which was held at Emory University at Atlanta on June 23–28. A part of its Japanese summary, namely “The Original of *Jingtu*—on the Basis of the *Wuliang Qingjing Pingdeng Jue Jing*”, will be published in the No. 2 of the Vol. 57 Journal of Japanese Association of Indian and Buddhist Studies (forthcoming). For convenience, throughout this paper, I make the tone marks only with the Chinese characters appearing the first time in the paper.
- 3) Even though there are many labels for this special Buddha, such as *Wuliang shou fo* 無量壽佛 or *Wuliang qingjing* 無量清淨 and so on, in convenient I would like to use the most familiar Chinese style of this Buddha, *Amituo* 阿彌陀, throughout the whole study.
- 4) See Fujita 2007: 3–4.
- 5) I would like to appreciate Karashima for his patient and intelligent teaching at the Early Chinese Translations (ECT) session.

Kumārajīva did not intend to indicate that *Amituo*'s land should be labelled by the term *jingtu*⁶⁾. On the other hand, *jingtu* is used frequently indicating *Amituo*'s realm, *sukhāvātī*, in Tānluán's 曇鸞 (476–542) work, *Wúliàngshòu jīng yōupótīshéyuànshēng jì pòsǒu pāntóu pūsà zào zhù* 無量壽經優婆提舍願生偈婆藪槃頭菩薩造註 (hereafter *Wúliàngshòu jīng lùnzhù* 無量壽經論註, T40, No. 1819), an annotation of Vasubandhu's *Wúliàngshòu jīng yōupótīshéyuànshēng jì* 無量壽經優婆提舍願生偈 (attributed to Bodhiruci, or *Pútíliúzhī*, 菩提流支, hereafter *Wúliàngshòu jīng lùn* 無量壽經論, T26, No. 1524). There, *jīng* 淨 is an adjective meaning "pure". *Sukhāvātī*, however, does not mean *jingtu*, it means "utmost of bliss", as in Chinese *jīlè* 極樂⁷⁾. What is the origin of this *jingtu* term and why is *Amituo*'s realm labelled *jingtu* with *jīlè*, so-called *jīlè-jīngtū* 極樂淨土 or *ānlè-jīngtū* 安樂淨土? Is it a misunderstanding by Tanluan of the previous *jingtu* in Kumārajīva's translation, or is there another origin for this term different from Kumārajīva's? And what is the relationship between *sukhāvātī* and *jingtu*? Many scholars⁸⁾ have tried to discuss this important problem, in spite of this, but these problems are still shrouded in darkness and obscurity. More work remains to be done. The aim of this paper is to make some progress towards this goal.

First of all, through an investigation of *sukhāvātī* in the oldest versions of the Larger *Sukhāvātīvyūha-sūtra*, *Fóshuō āmítuó sānyé sānfó sàlòu fótán guòdù réndào jīng* 佛說阿彌陀三耶三佛薩樓佛檀過度人道經 (hereafter the *Da amituo jing*, T12, No. 362), and understanding that in addition to *xūmóti* 須摩提, the name of *sukhāvātī* is also used as *Amituofó guó* 阿彌陀佛國 "the Land of *Amituo*", which is connected with the Buddha's name, *Amituo*. Secondly, a brief introduction to *jingtu* used in Mahāyāna sūtras, meaning purifying the Buddha land as a verb. Additionally, a further discussion on the origin of the name of the Buddha in the *Fóshuō Wúliàng Qīngjìng Pīngdēng jué jīng* 佛說無量清淨平等覺經 (hereafter the *Pīngdēng jué jīng*, T12, No. 361), *Wúliàng qīngjìng* 無量清淨, and understanding that in addition to *xumoti*, the name of *sukhāvātī* is also used as *Wúliàng qīngjìng fōguó (tǔ)* 無量清淨佛國 (土). Finally, through evidence verifying that term *jingtu* is derived from the name of the Buddha in the *Pīngdēng jué jīng*, *Wúliàng qīngjìng*.

6) See Hiragawa 1985: 13.

7) This translation was first used in the *Amituo jing*, attributed by Kumārajīva. And this term can also be read in the early Chinese traditional cultural work, *Huái nán zī* 淮南子 and *Xīdūfù* 西都賦 (HD4: 1134, and also see Fujita 2007: 350–351).

8) The prominent scholars among them are Fujita Kōtatsu (1970: 507–512 and 2007: 383), Hiragawa Arkira (1985: 2–54), Kagawa Takao (1993:172–5), Shibata Toru, Jan Nattier (2007) and Karashima Seishi, just the deadline of this paper, Karashima presented a paper, entitled 阿彌陀淨土の原風景—淨土は Pure Land か— 2008 Handout)

Xumoti* 須摩題 and *Amituo fo guo* 阿彌陀佛國 in the *Da amituo jing

One indisputable fact is that *sukhāvātī* was still used in the early Mahāyāna sūtras. The term *jingtu*, however, was not yet used to refer to *Amituo*'s religion in combination with *jile* 極樂, in the period of this early translation. According to previous study, the term *jingtu* was established after Chinese Buddhism⁹⁾. In the early Chinese Buddhist canons, *sukhāvātī* was translated as *xūmóti* 須摩提¹⁰⁾ or written 須摩題¹¹⁾, *xūhémóti* 須呵摩提¹²⁾, *xūāti* 須阿提¹³⁾, *xūhémóchī* 須訶摩持¹⁴⁾. According to Fujita's suggestion, they derived from a transliteration of Gandharī, **sukamadi*¹⁵⁾. Karashima, however, pointed out a different suggestion than Fujita, which it is *sukhāvātī* > **suhāmati* or **su'āmati*¹⁶⁾. In general, because these kinds of transliteration could obviously not have been understood by Chinese audiences, there are other names in both sūtras of the Early Recension of the Larger *Sukhāvātīvyūha-sūtra*. And it seems that these names should be consciously labelled by means of the Buddha's name by two sūtras' author(s)¹⁷⁾, *Amituo fo guo* 阿彌陀佛國 "Amituo Buddha's realm" in the *Da amituo jing* and *Wuliang qingjing fo guo* 無量清淨佛國 "Wuliang qingjing Buddha's realm" in the *Pingdeng jue jing*. In spite of this, the *Pingdeng jue jing*'s active effect should not be neglected. This problem, the connection of *Wuliang qingjing fo guo(tu)* 無量清淨佛國(土) and *jingtu* term, is the other main topic which I want to discuss carefully below. Here, I would like to investigate what *sukhāvātī* means in the *Da amituo jing* through the name of *Amituo fo guo* 阿彌陀佛國, which it stems from the name of the Buddha, *Amituo* 阿彌陀, in the *Da amituo jing*.

9) Fujita 1970: 432–438 = 2007: 383–390.

10) *Bōzhōu sānmèi jīn*, 般舟三昧經, Skt. *Pratyutpanna-buddhasaṃmukhāvasthita-samādhi*, both in three *juan* 卷 (T13, No. 418) and in one *juan* (T13, No. 417). *Báopō púsà jīng* 拔陂菩薩經 (T13, No. 419); *Pingdeng jue jing* 平等覺經 (T 12, No. 361); *Fāngděng bān níhúan jīng* 方等般泥洹經 (T 12, No. 378).

11) Occurs in the *Da amituo jing*.

12) Occurs in the *Huì yìn sānmèi jīng* 慧印三昧經 (T 15, No. 632) and the *Sān màn tuó bā tuó lóu púsà jīng* 三曼陀跋陀羅菩薩經 (T 4, No. 483).

13) It also occurs in the *Pingdeng jue jing*.

14) Occurs in the *Púsà shòu zhāijīng* 菩薩受齋經 (T 24, No. 1502), attributed to *Niè Dào zhēn* 聶道真. Its first sentence in the verse should be considered, it reads 清淨尊神國, 安穩在西方. Here, *Amituo* is labelled as a pure deity, and his land is in the west.

15) See Fujita 1970: 431–438.

16) **Sukhāvātī*; Khotanese *Suhavatā*, see Karashima 2007: 339 = 2008.

17) According to Yinshùn 印順 (1985) and Harrison (1998), the authorship of the *Pingdeng jue jing* is probably Zhī Qiān 支謙. Some different suggestions on this problems remain, I would like to give a reconsideration more carefully in the future.

Concerning *Amituo* in the *Da amituo jing*, two special characteristics should be specially noticed. First of all, the meaning of *Amituo* in the *Da amituo jing* corresponds to Sanskrit *Amitābha* “measureless light”.¹⁸⁾ Secondly, in this case, *Amituo* is connected with measureless wisdom. Recognition of wisdom is one of the primary characteristics in the *Da amituo jing*. The intention of rebirth in *sukhāvātī* in the *Da amituo jing* is aimed not only at overcoming *Samsara*, but also at attainment of the wisdom like Buddha’s¹⁹⁾.

It is of particular interest to see that the formal name of *sukhāvātī*, *xumoti* 須摩題, was only used once. By contrast, *Amituo fo guo* 阿彌陀佛國 was frequently as can be seen here and there over sixty times in the *Da amituo jing*. Obviously, *Amituo fo guo* is derived from *Amituo*’s name. Therefore, the characteristics of *sukhāvātī* can be recognized by means of *Amituo*’s name in the *Da amituo jing*, and it also shows measureless light and wisdom.

***Jingtu* in Mahāyāna Sutras/ Purifying the Buddha Land as a Verb**

According to Kagawa’s study, the term *jingtu* in the early Chinese Buddhist translations was first used frequently in the *Miàofāliánhuá jīng* 妙法蓮華經 (T9, No. 262), a Chinese translation of Sanskrit *Saddharmapūṇḍarīka*, attributed to Kumārajīva²⁰⁾. The context is as follows:

為淨佛土故，常作佛事佛事教化衆生。(T9, No. 262: 27c10)

(In order to purify the Buddha Land he always did what the Buddhas have done and led and inspired sentient beings.) (Kubo, Yuyama: 152)

buddhakṣetraṃ pariśodhayati sma sattvānāṃ ca paripākāyābhiyukto’bhūt²¹⁾

Jingtu in the above context means purifying the Buddha land as a verb, so-called 淨佛國土. Kagawa also pointed out that in contexts akin to the above, *jingtu* is used to mean purifying the Buddha land as a verb, and can also be found frequently in another of Kumārajīva’s translations, the *Mōhé bānrùo bōluómì jīng* 摩訶般若波羅蜜經 **Mahāprajñā-pāramitā* (T8, No. 223).

As I mentioned above, the term *jingtu* was not used in the *Amituo jing* (T12, No. 366,

18) See Nattier 2006 and Karashima 2008.

19) See Xiao 2007 = 2008.

20) Fujita1970, and Kagawa1993: 172–5.

21) Also see Kagawa 1993:173.

smaller *Sukhāvātvīyūha-sūtra*), the most important sūtra in *Amituo*'s religion among the majority of Kumārajīva's translations. I strongly agree with Hirakawa's suggestion²²⁾ that Kumārajīva himself did not intend to indicate that *Amituo*'s land, *sukhāvātī*, should be labelled *jingtu*, which he frequently used in his other Mahāyāna translations, such as in the *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra*, 摩訶般若波羅蜜經. In the *Amituo jing*, the realm of *Amituo* is translated as *jile* 極樂 "utmost bliss" by Kumārajīva. It is very interesting that the term *jile* is still used in the two typical traditional Chinese works, *Huánáizǐ* 淮南子 and *Xīdūfù* 西都賦²³⁾, attributed to *Bāngù* 班固 written during the Han Dynasty.

On the other hand, the term *jingtu* is surely used in one of the three Pure Land Sutras, *Fóshūo Wúliàngshòu Jīng*²⁴⁾ 佛說無量壽經 (T12, No. 360, hereafter *Wuliangshou jing*). In spite of one time, we have to discuss this case carefully here. Is it the earliest use of *jingtu* to indicate *Amituo*'s land? Kagawa's analysis helps us to approach this problem²⁵⁾. He suggested that the term *jingtu* in the *Wuliangshou jing* should be considered consciously being appended by the author of the *Wuliang shou jing*, for no counterpart can be found in the Sanskrit version. Moreover, the context does not address *Amituo*'s realm, it is talking about Bodhisavatta practice²⁶⁾. I agree with Kagawa's suggestion that this term probably derives from Mahāyāna sutras akin to the Kumārajīva's translation system²⁷⁾. The context with the term *jingtu* in the *Wuliang shou jing* is as follows:

唯願世尊。廣為敷演諸佛如來淨土之行。(T12, No. 360: 267b)

I only request that the World Honored One teach me extensively the practice by which all buddhas, tathagatas, purify their field.²⁸⁾

The counterpart of above context in the Sanskrit version is:

bhāṣatv anyeṣāṃ tathāgatānāṃ

22) See Hiragawa 1985: 13.

23) See footnote No. 7. *Xīdūfù* reads 方舟並鷺，俛仰極樂。

24) In Taisho, the authorship of this sūtra was attributed to Kāng Sēngkǎi 康僧鎧, or Saṅghavaman based on *kāiyuān shìjiào lù* 開元釋教錄, but most probably the work of Buddhahadra (359–429) and *Bāoyún* 寶雲 and therefore dating from 421 (see Fujita 1970: 62–96, cf. also Gómez 1996: 126–130. Also see Harrison 2002: 180).

25) See Kagawa 1993: 173–174.

26) Karashima gave an alternative suggestion about this problem. He suggested that the term *jingtu* in the *Wuliangshou jing* is derived from the effect of Zhi Qian's misunderstanding of *vyūha*. (see Karashima 2008).

27) Karashima suggested that this has some connections with ZhiQian's misunderstanding of *vyūha* (see Karashima 2008)

28) See Gómez 1996: 164.

buddhakṣetraguṇa-vyūhālamkāra-saṃpadaṃ. (Ashikaga: 9, 7-8, also see Kagawa:173)

(Explain to me, therefore, how one accomplishes this perfect ornament that is the array of wondrous qualities in the buddha-fields of other tathagatas.) (Gómez: 68)

In sum, *jingtu* in the *Wuliang shou jing* is derived from the Mahāyāna Bodhisavatta's practice. On the other hand, because the *Wuliang shou jing* was identified by Hōnen²⁹⁾ as one of the three Pure Land sūtras, many people, including scholars, confused the term *jingtu* in the *Wuliang shou jing* with *jingtu*, which is used to express *Amituo's* Land and Pure Land Buddhism in Tanluan's work. Moreover, Buddhist scholars who profess *Amituo's* religion is always tending to advocate Pure Land as the foremost type of Mahāyāna Buddhism based on one vehicle taught in the Lotus Sūtra.

Therefore, we can firmly conclude that *jingtu* which used to refer to rebirth in *Amituo's* Land and Pure Land Buddhism either had a different original system or was a misunderstanding by Tanluan, for *jingtu* used in the *Wuliangshou jing lunzhu* 無量壽經論註, meaning "Pure Land", here 淨 "purity", is an adjective. Where did this meaning come from? This is the main topic that I want to consider.

The Meaning of Jingtu for Amituo's Land

In addition to referring to Mahāyāna Bodhisavatta's practice, the term *jingtu* also has another completely different meaning, that of *Amituo's* pure realm. In this case, *jingtu* is used in the *Pingdeng jue jing* as *Wuliang qingjing foguo (tu)* 無量清淨佛國 (土), and then is inherited in the *Houchū āmitúo fō jì* 後出阿彌陀佛偈 (T12, No. 373) as its abbreviation, *qingjing* "purity". *Anle jingtu* 安樂淨土 "Pure Land of Peace and Joy" was used many times to express *Amituo's* land in Tanluan's work, *Wuliangshou jing lunzhu* 無量壽經論註³⁰⁾, which is considered to be one of the most important works, equal to the three Pure Land sūtras. But what is the origin of this term *jingtu*³¹⁾? In order to make the problems clear, I would like to discuss them one by one in the next section.

29) See *Senchaku hongan nenbutsu shu* 選択本願念仏集.

30) *Anle guo* 安樂國 and *Anle shijie* 安樂世界 was used in the *Wuliang shoujing lun*, attributed to *Bodhiruci*, or *Pūtīlīūzhī* 菩提流支 (See blow).

31) *Jingtu* is still found in the *Xie Lingyun's* 謝靈運 (385–433), *Wuliang shou song* 無量壽頌, "a very short verse for *Wuliang shou fo* 無量壽佛 in the *Guāng hōngmíng jí* 廣弘明集 (T52, No. 2103: 200a)", Xie Lingyun's works had no great effect on Chinese Buddhism in later, even to early Chinese Pure Land Buddhism. Therefore, this problem is not the main topic here.

Wuliang qingjing* 無量清淨 in the *Pingdeng jue jing

The two oldest versions of the Larger *Sukhāvativyūha-sūtra*, the *Da amituo jing* and the *Pingdeng jue jing*, are almost the same, except for the names of the Buddha and Bodhisattvas. For example, *Amituo* 阿彌陀 is a transliteration in the *Da amituo jing*, but *Wuling qingjing* 無量清淨 is rendered as a free translation, on the basis of Chinese traditional culture, in the *Pingdeng jue jing* in order that it could be easily understood by its Chinese audience³². Even though the *Pingdeng jue jing* 平等覺經, as a matter of fact, is almost a revision of the older text³³, the positive effect in the early Chinese Pure Land sūtras cannot be ignored either. While studying the names of the Buddha in the Early Recension of the Larger *Sukhāvativyūha-sūtra*, I observed that these two sūtras, the *Da amituo jing* and the *Pingdeng jue jing*, show larger different characteristics despite being largely parallel. According to Karashima and Nattier's suggestion, the name of the Buddha in the *Da amituo jing*, *Amituo*, should mean measureless light³⁴, in addition to that, close connections with measureless wisdom in the *Da amituo jing* have been more pronounced³⁵. Moreover, it seems in some way that the name of the Buddha, *Wuliang qingjing* 無量清淨, in the *Pingdeng jue jing*, have some connections with the formation of the term *jingtu*, as well as *jingtu jiao* 淨土教 “Pure Land Buddhism”³⁶. This connection was also noticed in advance by Hiragawa, but he did not give a positive response on this, for the simple reason that he was not able to understand why the name of the Buddha in the *Pingdengjue jing* was switched to *Wuliang qingjing* 無量清淨³⁷.

Concerning the origin of the name of the Buddha in the *Pingdeng jue jing*, *Wuliang qingjing* 無量清淨 “measureless purity”, only two suggestions have been made to date. First, NATTIER gave a very careful investigation on the basis of ZhiQian's 支謙 translations, concluding that “it may be derived from a misunderstanding of an Indian term³⁸, *vyūha*.” Meanwhile, I have presented a completely different solution for this problem, namely that

32) See Xiao 2007=forthcoming c.

33) See Harrison 2002: 179-181.

34) See Karashima and Nattier 2007.

35) See Xiao 2007=forthcoming c.

36) I firstly observed this point in 2007's paper, and give a further discussion at the Japanese Association of Indian Buddhist Studies 2008 held at Aichi-gakuin University (Xiao forthcoming a).

37) See Hiragawa 1985: 16-17.

38) See Nattier 2007. Karashima also presented to this pivotal problem on the basis of Nattier's conclusion.

qingjing 清淨 probably derives from Chinese culture, Taoism. In this case, *qingjing* is similar in meaning to *wuwei* 無爲 “no-ado”³⁹⁾.

The following points help us confirm that the author of the *Pingdeng jue jing*⁴⁰⁾ consciously ‘compiled’ the sūtra on the basis of his traditional Chinese culture background in order that the sūtra can be easily understood by its Chinese audiences⁴¹⁾.

First of all, according to Mori’s statistics, we can find the term *ziran* 自然, ‘nature’, 177 times in the *Pingdeng jue jing*⁴²⁾. As matter of fact, *ziran* 自然 is used as a typical phrase in Taoism combined with *wuwei* 無爲⁴³⁾. In addition to this, Fujita also pointed out that the terms *xūwú* 虛無, *wújí* 無極, *daojiao* 道教, and so on used in the Larger *Sukhāvātīvyūha* have no counterpart in the Sanskrit version, and these are typical Taoist phrases⁴⁴⁾.

Secondly, it is well known that five-evil paragraphs found in the *Da amituo jing* and the *Pingdeng jue jing* and the *Wuliang shou jing* were probably added by someone depending on his Chinese culture background⁴⁵⁾.

Furthermore, the part of the vow articles is the most important context in the Larger *Sukhāvātīvyūha*, but in two sūtras of the Early Recension the vows number only has twenty-four. On the one hand, twenty-four is of much interest in traditional Chinese culture, for example, there are twenty-four solar terms⁴⁶⁾, *jieqi* 節氣, in Chinese calendar. On the other hand, according to Sizudani⁴⁷⁾, as matter of fact the number of the *Da amituo jing*’s vow are not twenty-four as some vows are combination of two or three vows, such

39) *Qingjing wuwei* 清淨無爲 plays an important role in Chinese traditional Taoist thought. For example, *Shūoyuàn jūndào* 說苑 君道, attributed by *Liúxiàng* 劉向 written during the Han Dynasty, reads 人君之道, 清淨無爲. *Qingjing anle* 清淨安樂 reads in 菩薩本緣經 (T3, No. 153: 55b)

40) See *Yinshun*1986: 759–763, and Harrison 1988 and 1999. On the other hand, Kagawa have suggested that the *Pingdeng jue jing* should be considered the work of Dharmarakṣa

41) As matter of fact, this function is still in existence in the *Da amituo jing*, but there is no doubt that its characteristics appear more obvious in the *Pengdeng jue jing*.

42) In the *Da amituo jing*, *ziran* can be found 146 times, on the contrary we can only find this term 56 times in the *Wuliang shou jing* (see Mori 1966: 239).

43) See Xiao2007.

44) See Fujita 1994: 47–48.

45) See Fujita1970 and Kagawa 1993.

46) The whole names of twenty-four solar terms firstly found in the chapter of *Tiānwēn* 天文 in *Huainan-zi* 淮南子, a typical Taoist work written during the Han Dynasty, and also can be found in the *Hanshu* 漢書.

47) See Sizudani 1974: 54.

as No. 2, No. 3, No. 4 etc. And the author of the *Pingdeng jue jing* obviously inherited this characteristic even though he re-translated this part showing large differences in content with the *Da amituo jing* in general. In sum, the vow articles, both in the *Da amituo jing* and the *Pingdeng jue jing* are probably compiled by someone in order that the vows' number would correspond to a special number representing 'nature' in Chinese culture.

Additionally, *Wuliang qingjing* can only be read of as *Amituo's* name in the *Pingdeng jue jing*, and there is not a similar name for *Amituo* in the Larger *Sukhāvātīvyūha*. On how to understand the Tibetan Version's title, see Xiao forthcoming c.

So it is without doubt that *Wuliang qingjing* is a conscious invention by the author of the *Pingdeng jue jing* based on the situation at that time. In sum, *qingjing* 清淨, in the *Pingdeng jue jing* used as *Amituo's* Name, does not have an origin in the Sanskrit version, but rather reflects an attempt to make this name more meaningful for Chinese people. It is probably an invention of the author of the *Pingdengjue jing* based on Chinese traditional culture, Taoism. *Qingjing* 清淨, "Purity", has two meanings. On the one hand, *qingjing* 清淨 "purity" represents the ideal characteristic of human beings in the *Huainan zi* 淮南子, one of foremost representative Taoist texts in the Han Dynasty. On the other hand, *qingjing* 清淨 is similar in meaning to *wuwei* 無爲 "no-ado", and *wuwei* 無爲 is used to refer to nirvana in the early Chinese Buddhist texts. So *wuliang qingjing* 無量清淨 is most suitable to represent a Buddha, introduced from a foreign culture, who has attained the highest stage for the Chinese people⁴⁸⁾.

***Xumoti* 須摩提 and *Wuliang qingjing fo guo (tu)* 無量清淨佛國 (土)**

As discussed above, the formal name of *Amituo's* realm, *sukhāvātī*, in the *Pingdeng jue jing* is *xumoti*, but it is read of only three times. On the contrary, *Wuliang qingjing fo guo (tu)*, akin to *Amituo fo guo* 阿彌陀佛國 discussed above in the *Da amituo jing*, is used here and there over sixty times. In addition to these two names, *anle* 安樂 is also used in the *Pingdeng jue jing* for the name *sukhāvātī*⁴⁹⁾ (T 12, No. 361:288c). According to my recent study, in Chinese culture, *anle* 安樂 = *tianyu* 恬愉 = *qingjing* 清淨 (other evidence see

48) See Xiao 2007 and 2008.

49) T12, No. 361: 288c, the counterpart in the Sanskrit version *Sukhāvātīn* (Ashigaki 1965: 47).

Xiao forthcoming c). In sum, *Wuliang qingjing fo guo* stems from the name of the Buddha in the *Pingdeng jue jing*, *Wuliang qingjing*. There is no doubt that *Wuliang qingjing fo guo tu*, “*Wuliang qingjing* Buddha’s land”, is easily regarded as meaning “measureless pure land” (*jingtu* 淨土). Moreover, *anle* is similar in meaning to *qingjing* 清淨, *wuwei* 無爲 (T12: 311c cf. T12: 293c cf. T12: 274b). We can surely conclude that *jingtu* referred to *Amituo*’s land derived from the Buddha’s name in the *Pingdeng jue jing*, *Wuliang qingjing*. The following evidence can make this idea more clear.

***The Evidence from Qingjing the Houchu Amituo-fo ji* 後出阿彌陀佛偈**

Hòuchū Āmítúo fó jì 後出阿彌陀佛偈 (T12, No. 373) is a very short verse for *Amituo* Buddha. According to Taishō, its authorship is probably someone from the *Houhan* 後漢 Dynasty, but it is not difficult to understand that this is not the true, as this verse is probably written on the basis of the *Pingdeng jue jing*⁵⁰). Therefore its formation must be later than the *Pingdeng jue jing*. The context of 誓二十四章 is the best evidence that verse was not translated from an Indian manuscript.

惟念法比丘 / 乃從世繞王
發願喻諸佛 / 誓二十四章
世世見諸佛 / 垓數無有量
不廢宿命行 / 功德遂具成
世界名清淨 / 得佛號無量

國界平夷易 / 豐樂多上人 (T12, No. 373, pp. 364b12–17)

Here, *Fabiqiu* 法比丘 is an abbreviation for 法寶藏比丘 in the *Pingdeng jue jing*, *Qingjing* is an abbreviation for *Wuliang qingjing fo guo (tu)* 無量清淨佛國土, and *Wuliang* is an abbreviation for *Wuliang qingjing* 無量清淨, that it is 法 = 法寶藏, 清淨 = 無量清淨佛國, 無量 = 無量清淨⁵¹). The last sentence is the best evidence to make the problem clearly. *Yíyì* 夷易 means flat, here both *yi* 夷 and *yi* 易 are similar in meaning *ping* 平⁵²) “flat”. I agree with what Fujita suggested in 1970, that we should not have supposed *Amituo*’s original Sanskrit depends on *wuling* 無量 in *Houchu amituo fo ji*⁵³).

50) Concerning its formation, See Sio 1933: 388, Sakaino 1935: 186 Fujita 1970: 299, Saito 2006.

51) The connections of *Wuliang qingjing foguo tu* with *jingtu*, also see Xiao forthcoming a.

52) See HD2: 1495.

53) See Fujita 1970: 297.

This is the oldest evidence that *Amituo*'s realm is labelled *qingjing* 清淨土 which is derived from *Wuliang qingjing* in the *Pingdeng jue jing*. Because *Amituo*'s realm is also translated as *anle* 安樂 in the *Pindeng jue jing*, this is the best evidence that the author of *Houchu amituo fo ji* must also have thought *qingjing* 清淨 is similar in meaning to *anle* 安樂.

Wuliangshou jing lun* 無量壽經論 and the *Pingdeng jue jing

I would like to consider Paul Harrison's contribution to the Larger *Sukhāvativyūha*. He made a comparative study of it. In his study, he discovered that *qingjing tu* 清淨土 and *anle* indicate *Amituo*'s realm⁵⁴ and are still used in the *Foming jing* 佛名經 (T14, No. 440) by *Putiliuzhi* 菩提流支 who is also familiar with *Wuliangshou jing lun*'s translator and taught the *Guān wūliàng shòu jīng* 觀無量壽經 (T 12, No. 365) to Tanluan.

Even though *Wuliang shoujign lun* is a commentary on the *Wuliang shoujing* based on its title, we cannot deny there are some connections between *Wuliang shoujing lun* and the *Pingdeng jue jing*. The following two points can help us confirm that there are some connections between the *Wuliangshou jing lun* and the *Pingdend jue jing*.

First, in the *Wuliang shoujing lun*, *Amituo*'s realm is labelled *anle guo tu* 安樂国 and *anle shijie* 安樂世界. These two names must be derived from the *Pingdeng jue jing* as above mentioned, in the *Pingdeng jue jing*,

速疾超便可到 安樂国之世界 (T 12, No. 361, pp. 288 c6–7)

Secondly, the following context is from the *Wuliang shoujing lun*.

能生清淨佛國土 (T 26, No. 1524, pp. 233a01)

Can be reborn in *wuliang qingjing* Buddha's land.

Concerning the meaning of *qingqing fo guo tu* 清淨佛國土, two possibilities can be considered, first, pure Buddha's land in general; secondly, an abbreviation of *Wuliang qingjing fo guo tu* "Wulaing qingjing Buddha's land". I tend to accept the second suggestion. In sum, *qingjing* which occurs in the *Wuliangshou jing lun* has a connection with the *Pingdeng jue jing*.

54) See Harrison 2002: 209.

Jingtu in Tanluan's Wuliangshou jing lunzhu 無量壽經論註

As discussed above, in the *Wuliangshou jing lun*, *Amituo's* land, *sukhāvātī* was labelled 安樂国, or *anle shijie* 安樂世界 “the Land of Peace and Bliss (Inagaki:127), but in Tanluan's *Wuliangshou jing lunzhu* *sukhāvātī* was called 安樂淨土 “Peaceful and Pure Land”. The following context can help us understand why Tanluan called *Amida's* land to *jingtu*.

安樂淨土諸往生者無不淨色無不淨心。畢竟皆得清淨平等無為法身。

以安樂国清淨性成就故。

Those born in the Pure Land of Peace and Bliss are free of the impurity of body and mind; they will ultimately attain the Pure Unconditioned Dharmakāya of Equality⁵⁵.

(Inagaki: 143)

Concerning *qingjing pingdeng wuwei* 清淨平等無為法身, it is probably purity and equality and no-ado⁵⁶ (nirvana) Dharmakāya. It is almost impossible to think that Tanluan understood Sanskrit, for his biography reminds us of his strong Taoist background. In this case, on the one hand, we can firmly suppose that *Qingjing pingdeng* derives from the Name of the Buddha in the *Pingdeng jue jing*, *wuliang qingjing pingdeng jue* 無量清淨平等覺. In the early Chinese Buddhist texts, on the other hand, *wuwei* 無為 is a Chinese term deriving from Taoism, but it is used to refer to nirvana, which is considered as the highest stage in Buddhism in the early Chinese translations. Furthermore *anle* 安樂 is used in combination with *qingjing*, so we can understand that Tanluan also must have thought *qingjing* is similar in meaning to *anle*.

In sum, even though the *Da amituo jing* is older than the *Pingdeng jue jing*, the *Da amituo jing* would have been very difficult for Tianluan to understand. Many Mahāyāna sūtras were quoted in the *Wuliangshou jing lunzhu*, yet, Tianluan's intention was none other than to certify his formative Pure Land Buddhist thought, which mainly derives from the *Pingdeng jue jing*, to be one vehicle Buddhism.

55) Also see Inagaki: 296, he translated 無為法身 into Unconditioned Dharma-body on the Sanskrit term *asṃskṛta-dharmakāya*.

56) Here no-ado 無為, a Chinese term in Taoism, is probably similar in meaning to nirvana in the early Chinese translation, which is considered as the highest stage in Buddhism.

Further evidence from *Anleji* 安樂集

Other evidence on the connection of Pure Land Buddhism with the *Pingdeng jue jing* can be found in the *Ānlè jí* 安樂集 (T47, No. 1958), attributed to Dàoqiū 道綽.

First, the title *anle ji* 安樂集 must be derived from *anle guo* 安樂国 as first used in the *Pingdeng jue jing*. As discussed above, *anle* is similar in meaning *qingjing* and *jingtu*⁵⁷⁾ (*anle* 安樂 = *qingjing* 清淨 = *jingtu* 淨土).

Secondly, the following context is the best evidence to prove the connection between Pure Land Buddhism and the *Pingdeng jue jing*:

《無量清淨覺經》云：「善男子，善女人，聞說淨土法門，心生悲喜，身毛為豎，如拔出者，當知此人過去宿命，已作佛道也。若復有人，聞開淨土法門，都不生信者，當知此人始從三惡道來」(T47, 1958)

According to the *Wuliang qingjing jue jing sūtra*, if a good man or woman hears of Pure Land Buddhism and they feel sad and happy and their body hair stands up, we should know that they practiced the Buddha Path in a past life. If a man hears of Pure Land Buddhism and does not believe it, it should be known that he came from one of the three evil realms.

Conclusion

In light of the above investigations, the following conclusions can be deduced:

Sukhāvātī is translated as *xumoti* 須摩提 in the *Da amituo jing*, there is another name for it, *Amituofo guo* 阿彌陀佛国. According to above discussion, *Amituo* means not only measureless light in the *Da amituo jing*, but also measureless wisdom. In this case, *sukhāvātī* represents measureless light with measureless wisdom on the basis of the characteristics of *Amituo*'s name. Recognition of wisdom is one of *sukhāvātī*'s important characteristics in the *Da amituo jing*. The intention of rebirth in *sukhāvātī* in the *Da amituo jing* is aimed not only at overcoming Samsara, but rather at the attainment of Buddha-like wisdom.

In addition to *xumoti* 須摩提, *Wuliang qingjing fo guo tu* 無量清淨佛國土 and *anle* 安樂

57) By no means do I deny that the counterpart of *anle* in the *Wuliang shoujing* is *sukhāvātīm*, but it is impossible for us to consider that *anle* read in Tuanluan's work is derived from Sanskrit.

are also used in the *Pingdeng jue jing*, as the name of *Amituo*'s land. The term *jingtu* 淨土 representing *Amituo*'s religion is derived from the name of the Buddha in the *Pingdeng jue jing*, *Wuliang qingjing* 無量清淨. *Wuliang qingjing foguo (tu)* is the origin of the term *jingtu* referring to *Amituo*'s realm. The best evidence is *Hochu amituo fo ji*.

In traditional Chinese, *qingjing* 清淨 is similar in meaning to *tianyu* 恬愉 and *anle* 安樂. *Anle* and *anle-jingtu* are frequently used in the *Wuliang shoujing lun* and Tanluan's *Wuliang shoujing lun zhu*. Tanluan had a strong background in Chinese Taoism, and the term *anle-jingtu* must be derived from Tuanlan's typical Taoist background, and from the name of the Buddha in the *Pingdeng jue jing*, *Wuliang qingjing*, based on traditional Chinese culture. Its meaning is a pure place, a no-ado place, an ideal nirvana place, and an *anle* "pleasure" place. This is one good representative of what had happened when early Mahāyāna Buddhism was transferred to China.

Abbreviations

HD=*Hanyu da cidian* 漢語大詞典 13 Vols. Shanghai: *Hanyu da cidian chubanshe*.

T=J. Takakusu & K. Watanabe, eds., *Taishō shinshū daizōkyō*. 100 vols. (Tokyo: Taishō issaikyō kankōkai, 1924–35).

Bibliography

- ASHIKAGA Atsuji 足利惇氏, 1965: *Daimuryō jyukyō bonhon* 大無量壽經梵本 [A Sanskrit Version of Larger Sukhāvativyūha Sūtra], Hōzōkan 法藏館.
- FUJITA Kōtatsu 藤田宏達, 1970: *Genshi Jōdo shisō no Kenkyō* 原始淨土思想究 [A Study on the Early Pure Land Buddhism Thoughts]. Tokyo: Iwanami shoten 岩波書店.
- , 1975: *Bonbun Wayaku Muryō jyukyō & Amida kyō* 梵文和訳無量壽經・阿彌陀經 [A Japanese Translation of Larger and Smaller Sukhāvativyūha Sūtra from Sanskrit Version], Hōzōkan 法藏館.
- , 2001: *Amidakyō kōkyū* 阿彌陀經講究 [A Lecture on the Smaller Sukhāvativyūha sūtra's Studies]. Kyoto: Shinshū Ōtani-ha shūmusho shuppanbu.
- , 2007: *Jōdo Sanbu Kyō no Kenkyō* 淨土三部經の研究 [A Study on the Three Pure Land Sūtras]. Tokyo: Iwanami shoten 岩波書店.
- GÓMEZ, Luis O 1995: *Land of Bliss—The Paradise of the Buddha of Measureless light—Sanskrit and Chinese Versions of the Sukhāvativyūha Sutras*. University of Hawaii.
- HARRISON, Paul 1998: *The woman in the Pure Land: Some Reflections on the Textual Sources* *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 26: 533–572.
- , 1999: *On the Authorship of the Oldest Chinese Translation of the Larger Sukhāvati-vyūha-sūtra*
- HARRISON, Paul, Jens-Uwe Hartmann, and Matsuda Kazunobu, 2002: *Larger Sukhāvativyūhasūtra*. Manuscripts in the Schøyen Collection·III, *Buddhist Manuscripts Volume II*, p. 179–214.

- HIRAKAWA Akira 平川 彰, 1969: *Shoki Daijyō Koten no Kenkyō* 初期大乘仏教の研究 [A Study on the Early Mahāyāna Buddhism]. Tokyo: Sunjūsha 春秋社.
- , 1985: *Jōdo Shisō no Seiritsu* 浄土思想の成立. [A Formation of Pure Land Buddhism Thoughts]. Koza Daijyō Bukkyō (5)—Jōdo Shisō 講座大乘仏教 (5) 浄土思想. Tokyo:Shunjūsha 春秋社.
- , 1989: *Jōdo Sisō to Daijyōkai* 浄土思想と大乘戒. [A Study on Pure Land Buddhism Thoughts and Mahāyāna Precepts]. Tokyo: Hiragawa Akira Chosakushū 平川彰著作集 (7), Tokyo: Sunjūsha 春秋社.
- INAGAKI Hisao 稲垣久雄, 1984: *A Glossary of the Sukhāvativyūha Sūtras*.
- , 1998: *T'an-luan's Commentary on Vasubandhu's Discourse on the Pure Land—A Study and Translation*.
- , 2000: *The Three Pure Land Sūtras—A Study and Translation from Chinese*.
- MEIJI Yamada 1984: *The Sūtra of Contemplation of the Buddha of Immeasurable Life as Expounded by Śākyamuni Buddha*.
- MORI Mikisanro 森三樹三郎, 1966: *Rōsō to Bukkyō* 老荘と仏教 [A Study on the connection of Chinese *Laozi* & *Zhuangzi* with Buddhism], Tokyo: Hōzōkan 法蔵館
- NATTIER Jan, 2006–2007: The Names of Amitabha/Amitayus in Early Chinese Buddhist Translations (1,2), Annual Report of The International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhism at Soka University, for Academic Year 2006, 2007.
- , 2008: A Guide to the Earliest Chinese Buddhist Translations Texts from the Eastern Han 東漢 and Three Kingdoms 三國 Periods, Annual Report of The International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhism at Soka University, 2008.
- SEISHI KARASHIMA 辛嶋静志, 1999: *Dai Amidakyō yakuchū (1)* 『大阿弥陀經』 訳註. Bukkyō daigaku sōgō kenkyūjō kiyō 佛教大学総合研究所紀要, no. 6, pp. 135–150.
- , 2007a: *Dai Amidakyō yakuchū (8)* 『大阿弥陀經』 訳註 (八). Bukkyō daigaku sōgō kenkyūjō kiyō, no. 14, pp. 1–17.
- , 2007b: A Project for a Buddhist Chinese Dictionary. Annual Report of The International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhism at Soka University, vol. X, pp. 337–358.
- , 2008: The Original Landscape of Amitābha's Pure Land —Is *Jingtu* Pure Land or Purified Land? (A Handout for International Symposium The Mahāsāṃghika School, Mahāyāna and Gandhāra—The Encounter of Buddhist Art Historians, and Archaeologists with Buddhist Philologists—, Soka University, 29–30 November, 2008).
- KAGAWA TAKAO 香川孝雄, 1984: 無量寿經の諸本対照研究 *Muro Juko no Sohō Taisō Kenko*.
- , 1993: *Jōdo-kyō no Seiritsu teki Kenko* 浄土教の成立史的研究 [A Study on the Formational History of Pure Land Buddhism].
- , *Indo jōdo sisō no seiritsu to tenkai* インド浄土思想の成立と展開, [A Study on the Formation of Indian Pure Land Thoughts and its Development].
- , *Daijō Bukkyō kenkyō hōhōron* 大乘仏教研究方法論 [The Methodology for Mahāyāna Buddhism].
- , 1999: 『観無量寿經』の成立問題試考 [On the Formation of the *Guan-wu-liang-shou-jing*]. The Synthetic Studies of Pure Land Buddhism. March 1999 The Research Institute of Bukkyo Uni-

versity.

- SAITO TAKANOBU 斉藤隆信, 2006: *Goshutsu Amidabutsuge to Sono Youto* 『後出阿弥陀仏偈』とその用途 [A Study on the Houchu amitufo ji and its purpose]. *Jōdokyō tenseki no kenkyō* 浄土教典籍の研究, The Research Institute of Bukkyō University. pp. 11–29.
- SAKAINO Kōyō 境野黄洋, 1935: *Sina Bukkyō Seisi* 支那佛教精史 [A Accurate Study on Chinese Buddhism]. Tokyo: Sakaino Kōyō Hakase Ikō Kankōkai.
- SHIO Benkyō 椎尾辨匡, 1933: *Bukkyō Kyōten Gaisetsu* 佛教經典概説 [A Guide to the Buddhist Sūtras]. Tokyo: Koshi sha sho bo 甲子社書房.
- SHIBATA Toru 柴田 泰, 1992: *Yakugo tosite no Amidabutsu no Jōdo* 訳語としての阿弥陀仏の「浄土」 [A Study on the Chinese Translation of Amituo-fo's Jingtū].
- SIZUDANI MASAO 静谷正雄, 1974: *Syoki daijyō bukkyō no seiritsu katei* 初期大乘仏教の成立過程 [A Study on the Formation of the Early Mahāyāna Buddhism]. Kyoto Hyakkaen.
- XIAO YUE 肖越, 2007: *Muryō jyukyō no ningenkan* (1) 無量寿経の人間観 (一) [The View of Man in the Larger *Sukhāvativyūha-sūtra*], Vol. 15, The Journal of the Nippon Buddhist Education Research Association.
- , 2008: *Syoki muryō jyukyō ni okeru Amida to Muryō shōjyō* 初期無量寿経における阿弥陀と無量清浄 A Preliminary Study on the Names of the Buddha (*Amituo* and *Wuliang qingjing*) in the Early Recension of the Larger *Sukhāvativyūha-sūtra*.
- , forthcoming a: *Jōdo no yakugo—muryōshōjō byōdogakkyō wo cyūsin tosite* 浄土の訳語—『無量清浄平等覚経』を中心として. [The Origin of Jingtū in Pure Land Buddhism—on the basis of the *Wuliang Qingjing Pingdeng jue jing*]. No. 2 of the Vol. 57 Journal of Japanese Association of Indian and Buddhist Studies.
- , forthcoming b: 「無量寿経」の人間観 (二)—『平等覚経』を中心として The View of Man in the Larger *Sukhāvativyūha-sūtra* (2)—on the Basis of the *Wuliang qingjing Pingdeng jue jing*. Vol. 17, The Journal of the Nippon Buddhist Education Research Association.
- , forthcoming c: A Study on the Buddha's Names (*Amituo/Wuliang qingjing*) in the Early Recension of the Larger *Sukhāvativyūha-sūtra*. Vol. 15, The Bulletin of Association of Buddhist Studies Bukkyō Unoversity, pp 51-82.
- YINSHUN 印 順, 1986: *Chūqi Dàchéng Fōfā zhī Qiyuán yú Kāizhāng* 初期大乘佛法之起源與開展 [A Study on the Early Mahāyāna and its Development]. Taipei: Zhengwen chubanshe 正聞出版社.

(肖越 しょう えつ 嘱託研究員)